

Reports to Select Committees

Liverpool City Council



Report to:	Overview and Scrutiny Committee
Subject:	Proposed changes to provision of services by Clatterbridge Cancer Centre NHS Foundation Trust.
Report no:	
Date:	12 December 2014
Reporting officer:	Susan Rogers, Head of Strategy and Governance, Adult Social Care and Health, Liverpool City Council
Contact officer:	
Ward:	All Wards

1. Purpose and recommendations

A Joint Health Scrutiny Committee was established to consider proposals for changes to the provision of Cancer Services provided by Clatterbridge Cancer Centre NHS Foundation NHS Trust. The committee was established in line with the 'Protocol for Establishment of Joint Health Scrutiny in Cheshire and Merseyside'.

The committee received evidence from a wide range of stakeholders over a six week period in response to questions following key lines of enquiry. The report provides details of the scrutiny undertaken and the outcomes of this process to each scrutiny panel in the respective authority areas. The committee having received and considered the presented evidence makes the following recommendations.

Recommendations

The Committee unanimously supports the proposal for the development of Cancer Services as set out within the document 'Transforming Cancer Care Services'.

The Committee also makes the recommendation that the committee is retained to maintain their scrutiny and oversight role during the lifetime of the project. The mechanism by which this is established will be advised.

2. Overview

A Joint Health Overview and Scrutiny Committee (the Committee) was established in October 2014 under the Health and Social Care Act 2012 and the Local Authority (Public Health, Health and Wellbeing Boards and Health

Scrutiny) Regulations 2013 to consider proposals for changes to the provision of Cancer Services provided by Clatterbridge Cancer Centre NHS Foundation NHS Trust (CCC).

The Committee was established following consideration of the proposals made by Clatterbridge Cancer Centre Foundation NHS Trust in each local authority health scrutiny / select panel. All nine local authorities in the Merseyside and Cheshire Cancer Network area were included. Each local authority was asked to consider whether a substantial variation/development to services would be applicable and whether each respective local authority would wish to scrutinise the Transforming Cancer Care programme. Eight of the possible nine local authorities agreed that the Transforming Cancer Care programme was a substantial variation/development to services, and as a result, a joint overview scrutiny function was established to include the following: Cheshire West and Chester, Halton, Knowsley, Liverpool, Sefton, St Helens, Warrington and Wirral. Cheshire East Council chose not to participate in the joint scrutiny process stating their constituents would typically access The Christie Hospital, Manchester for oncology services.

The principles underpinning joint health scrutiny are set out in the 'Protocol for Establishment of Joint Health Scrutiny in Cheshire and Merseyside' (Appendix 1)

Joint Health Scrutiny Process

The membership of the Committee has included the following authorities:

- Cheshire West and Chester Council
- Halton Borough Council
- Knowsley Borough Council
- Liverpool City Council
- St Helens Metropolitan Borough Council
- Sefton Borough Council
- Warrington Borough Council
- Wirral Borough Council

The Committee has been chaired by an Elected Member and Chair of Adult Social Care and Health Select Committee from Liverpool City Council with an Elected Member from Wirral Borough Council as Deputy Chair. Membership of the committee was drawn from each of the above local authority areas.

The Joint Health Scrutiny Panel was convened for a period of six weeks and met on four occasions. The meetings heard evidence from:

- Executive Officers from Clatterbridge Cancer Centre NHS Foundation Trust
- Local service providers;
- Patients and the public;
- Staff Members
- Voluntary sector and community organisations; and NHS regulatory bodies.

In addition the panel received Transforming Cancer Care Merseyside and Cheshire Public Consultation Analysis of Findings following the period of public consultation that was conducted over the period 28th July 2014 until 19th October 2014.

Appended to this report are the minutes of the Joint Health Scrutiny meetings (Appendix 2).

The Committee would like to thank all stakeholders who attended the Committee to present information and their openness in responding to questions made by the committee members. Particular thanks are expressed to staff and patients who made the committee welcome on their visit to the Clatterbridge Cancer Centre on the Wirral and who made time to show the committee various aspects of the treatments carried out and the location of these. This was particularly helpful in assisting the committee to see and understand first-hand the opportunity that this proposed development creates for everyone in Cheshire and Merseyside.

3. Report Summary

Proposals for Transforming Cancer Care

The Transforming Cancer Care Project was established by CCC following agreement by the Merseyside and Cheshire Cancer Care Network (MCCCN) to implement recommendations made by Baker and Cannon (2008). This identified a number of reasons for considering a change in the service model location and delivery of Cancer Services across the area, the aim of which is to ensure that services were delivered in the best way to improve outcomes for patients. A key issue in the report was the geographical location of the specialist Cancer Centre on the Clatterbridge hospital site.

A feasibility study was subsequently undertaken by Price Waterhouse Coopers (2009) of the establishment of a new acute cancer centre in Liverpool. The project was therefore established by CCC to implement these proposals the most significant of which is the development of a new Cancer Centre in Liverpool adjacent to the redeveloped Royal Liverpool University Hospital.

The proposed new Cancer Centre would provide all inpatient oncology beds for the Cancer Network together with outpatient oncology services for those patients whom the Liverpool site is the most accessible. The new Cancer Centre would therefore operate as the hub supporting a network of cancer services including the satellite radiotherapy centre at Aintree Hospital, the existing Cancer Centre at Clatterbridge which in the proposals will continue to deliver outpatient cancer care to its local population on the Wirral and West Cheshire. This is in addition to the distributed network of CCC outpatient and chemotherapy peripheral sites operated in partnership with hospitals for the transformation of Cancer Services for people in Cheshire and Merseyside.

The Joint Health Scrutiny Panel reviewed the material included in the document 'Transforming Cancer Care – an opportunity to significantly improve

the delivery of Cancer Services across the Merseyside and Cheshire Cancer Network' from which key lines of enquiry were identified.

Scrutiny Committee Key Lines of Enquiry

Key lines of enquiry formed the basis of each of the meetings to which stakeholders provided responses to questions from members of the committee. These areas included the following:

- i. Case for change
- ii. Patient perspectives
- iii. Frontline staff perspectives
- iv. Financial Issues
- v. Project Management
- vi. Clinical Case for Change

An analysis of responses to the formal public consultation conducted between July and October 2014 was also received by the committee.

The report presents an overview of the key themes that have emerged from the evidence presented in response to questions and from presentations to the committee. The information presented in the rest of the report support the recommendations made by the Committee to the proposals made for transforming cancer care in Merseyside and Cheshire.

3. Key issues

From the evidence presented both in written and verbal format the Committee considered the following as key issues relating to the development of Cancer Services in Merseyside and Cheshire. Whilst the most significant element of the proposals are for the development of a new Cancer Centre in Liverpool, the committee also sought assurance on the continued provision of services through satellite sites at Aintree and on the Wirral but also the delivery of outpatient services at sites across Merseyside and Cheshire currently in place.

These issues have informed the committee's final recommendations.

Quality of Care

- The Clatterbridge Cancer Centre (CCC) is highly regarded as a specialist cancer trust. The committee heard from patients, senior clinical, front line staff and Trust Executives of the aspirations for the enhancement of the clinical services at the new hub in Liverpool. This will be developed in tandem with the continued development and maintenance of services at the current satellite site at Aintree and peripheral sites in Cheshire and Merseyside. A key element of the proposals includes the upgrading of facilities retained on the Wirral site following the proposed opening of the new facilities in Liverpool.
- The committee heard evidence in response to questions on how service quality and outcomes would be maintained and improved as a consequence of the proposals made for the creation of a new cancer centre in Liverpool.
- A key feature of the proposals is the enhancement of clinical services and

facilities to enable the trust to care for very acutely ill patients. This is currently not possible within the current site necessitating the transfer of patients who are critically ill to other hospitals. The location of Cancer Services alongside acute medical and surgical services was recognised by the committee as a key component in the delivery of high quality care for patients. Evidence presented included the need to create much closer alignment of oncologists with local general hospitals and so enable more integrated care than is possible from a remote site.

- The establishment of a new radiotherapy service in Liverpool will increase the current capacity of radiotherapy across Merseyside and Cheshire and which will be run in conjunction with the current capacity already in place at Aintree Hospital and that already in place at CCC on the Wirral. This proposal is in line with national and local guidance on the size of major Cancer Centres.
- Staff were on the whole supportive of the proposed development and recognised the benefits of this for patients. The consultation analysis however highlighted that just under 25% of staff did not consider that the proposals would help deliver and improve the quality of care. The committee heard of the on-going dialogue with staff and their trades unions as part of the project. It was also acknowledged that at a personal level there was likely to be difficulty in separating the personal impact from service impact which was likely to affect the perception of likely benefits of the proposals. The committee are concerned to ensure that staff remain engaged and to be recognised as key stakeholders within the project as it continues.
- The creation of a new hub in Liverpool was recognised as being a 'magnet' to attract and retain highly qualified and committed staff which could only be of benefit to patients.
- The committee heard additional evidence on the collaboration that exists between MCCN and the other Cancer Networks in Lancashire and Manchester. This was seen as important particularly for those who live on the edge of the Merseyside and Cheshire areas and for whom treatment at other sites for reasons of personal choice may be more appropriate.

Quality of Facilities

- Improving the quality of the clinical facilities at the new Cancer Centre is the key focus for the transformational plans for Cancer Services on Cheshire and Merseyside.
- This was confirmed through presentations and responses from all members of the Clatterbridge Cancer Centre including chief Executive, Medical and front line staff.
- Staff and patients believe that the proposals will provide high quality facilities that improve the service experience for all patients but particularly for those that are acutely unwell and for teenagers and young adults. All spoke of the opportunities to build on the excellence of clinical care and through the development of the new cancer Centre in Liverpool to transform and expand the range of high quality services in high quality facilities.
- In addition to the clinical facilities new and improved research facilities will be created. This will enable clinical and academic staff from the University of Liverpool to increase collaboration in a range of research opportunities which is considered to improve the outcomes for patients. This is discussed in

more detail in the subsequent section.

- The committee heard from a number of stakeholders that the proposals for the new hub have taken into account the future demand for services and delivery models.
- The Committee heard evidence confirming the planned new Cancer Centre in Liverpool and the continued investment in the satellite centre at Aintree and will continue to work with the hospital trusts across Merseyside and Cheshire where outpatient services are provided to continue to provide high quality services.
- The committee received assurance that alongside the proposed development of the new Cancer Centre in Liverpool, investment in the Wirral site is scheduled with a completion date of 2019.
- Cancer continues to be a high priority for NHS England through its specialist commissioning responsibility.

Access and Transport

- The development of the Cancer Centre hub in Liverpool raised issues relating to access for patients across Cheshire and Merseyside which the Committee explored in some detail with all stakeholders. In particular issues raised included access by public transport, car parking arrangements and travelling arrangements between sites for staff.
- All these issues were explored in some depth at each of the Committee's meetings.
- There was recognition that the current Cancer Centre location was geographically isolated but acknowledgement that for some groups of patients, visitors and staff the proposed relocation would be significant. The committee were keen to ensure that these issues were minimised and that project took these into account.
- The committee heard of the on-going work relating to transport planning for the new centre which will continue throughout the lifetime of the project.
- Car parking for patients and visitors was identified as a particular concern given the adjacency of the new cancer centre to Royal Liverpool Hospital and city centre. Information on the current arrangements for free car parking for patients and visitors at the current Clatterbridge Cancer Centre site was provided. There was acknowledgement of the practicalities of this system at a new site however there was an expressed commitment to this as an operating principle within the future development.
- Views from patients highlighted that the issue of travel and associated costs had been raised by many people. They however emphasised that as the prime reason for relocation of the service was to improve services for patients and this would outweigh any associated implications for the service relocation.
- Whilst much of the discussion focussed on access to the new Cancer Centre in Liverpool by car, the committee wished to see the continued consideration of the development of public transport options for staff, visitors and patients. The project Team have reflected their continued commitment to working with the relevant transport organisations across the region to ensure that this as a travel option is viable for all.
- The committee were anxious to ensure that access and transport

arrangements for staff were being considered as part of the planned development. Some groups of staff will continue to travel between sites as currently, but clearly with the relocation of the main treatment and planning centre being located in Liverpool will mean that many staff will be based permanently in Liverpool. A number of options are currently being discussed with staff and their trades unions with all options at this stage being considered.

- The committee were reassured by the information provided by stakeholders particularly from the Project Team in relation to this matter and would be keen to ensure that these issues remain prominent as they were seen as potential barriers to the successful implementation of a scheme which will undoubtedly bring many benefits as a consequence.

Patient Views

- The committee heard from a number of individual patients and representatives from the patient reference group for Transforming Cancer Care. The committee was concerned to hear the views of patients and visitors in response to the proposals for the development of services and that the proposals whilst providing enhanced facilities and quality of care were also supported by patients.
- Those attending the committee meeting indicated that the information provided at consultation events was well received when they understood that many services would be retained at the current site with the new hub in Liverpool being a new specialist centre. There was recognition of the need to balance issues relating to improved treatment against any implications associated with service relocation. They reflected that they considered that the improved service outweighed the issues of service relocation.
- Overall they felt that the proposals would raise the level of patient care and that the ethos of patient care at the heart of service delivery would be maintained by the trust. This would ensure that Clatterbridge Cancer Centre continued to be recognised as a centre of excellence for cancer care.

Research

- The proposals for the development of the new cancer centre in Liverpool is seen as creating the opportunity for the development of research facilities which will bring about greater benefits for patients from new treatments and through participation in clinical trials.
- The committee heard how the proposals will enable closer integration between the NHS and research teams at the University of Liverpool and other key research partners in the public and private sector.
- These developments are seen as placing CCC at the forefront of cancer research and treatment nationally and internationally.
- Staff who work in this area were genuinely excited by what this presented both in terms of research opportunities that are almost guaranteed to be developed as a consequence of improved facilities but also the ability to attract greater funding for cancer research and the benefits that this presented for patients in improving cancer outcomes.
- The benefits of being close to the medical school at the University of Liverpool was highlighted as being advantageous not only through the

initiation of research but also through being able to provide medical undergraduate training which is currently not possible with the current Cancer Centre in the Wirral. Opportunities to gain experience in oncology at undergraduate level, is more likely to encourage post qualification specialisation, so retaining medical staff in the city and increasing the likelihood of recruitment and retention of staff on an on-going basis. This also has benefits not only for medical staffing but is seen as applicable for all staff groups.

Project Management and Construction

- The Transforming Cancer Care Project has a dedicated Programme Director from whom the Committee received an overview of the project together with details of the programme. The outline business case has already been widely consulted on with the aim for this to be approved by June 2015 and full outline business case by early 2016. The proposal is for site works to commence to commence mid-2016.
- The Committee were concerned to understand the process for procurement of the contractor for the development of the new Cancer Centre. The committee received assurance that this had been conducted through the agreed process for capital investment schemes across England using a design and build contract similar to the NHS national procurement framework Procure 21. The selection of the contractor Laing O'Rourke was broadly 30% cost consideration and 70% quality and experience of the contractor. Reassurance was provided by the Programme Director relating to Health and safety considerations by the contractor.
- The committee heard that consideration had been given to ensuring Social Value aspects were taken into account within the procurement both relating to goods and services but the workforce employed on the project by the contractor. The committee are keen to explore the appropriate mechanisms for maintaining an overview of the project as the construction progresses; a proposal welcomed by the Programme Team and by the construction firm Laing O'Rourke.

Financial Sustainability

- The committee heard from both Chief Executive and Director of Finance of Clatterbridge Cancer Centre. The detail of the finance arrangements for the proposed development was provided to the Committee and is included within the minutes of the meeting. In summary the committee understand that the funding for the programme is from a mix of sources including, trust financial reserves, small borrowing and charity appeal. Commitments have been secured from the specialist commissioners responsible for commissioning cancer services derived from detailed financial planning. This is included in the trust's ten year financial plan not only required for this programme but also by Monitor who assures the financial sustainability.

Consultation outcomes

- A formal 12 week consultation was undertaken on the proposals for transforming Cancer Care. Analysis of the findings were independently analysed by researchers at the Centre for Public Health, Liverpool John Moores University. The committee received the Transforming Cancer Care

Merseyside and Cheshire Public Consultation Analysis of Findings and had opportunity to review and discuss outcomes with members of the Trust executive.

- Members of the committee expressed thanks to the Trust for commissioning this piece of work and the details contained within it. These had gone a long way in addressing previous concerns from the different local authorities relating to response rates and participation in the consultation.
- The committee considered that the whole process of consultation and engagement meant that the proposals consulted on were seen as having been stakeholder and user led and which were recognised as exemplary and should be seen as a model for any future developments.
- The outcomes of the consultation has provided additional evidence to the Committee and has confirmed the views expressed during the meetings by stakeholders and the themes outlined in this report.

4. Financial Implications

The proposals made by Clatterbridge Cancer Centre NHS Foundation Trust form part of the organisational ten year financial plan. The proposals and financial plan cover the period leading to conclusion of the construction of the new Cancer Centre in Liverpool. The ten year financial plan is also a requirement by Monitor. The committee heard that Cancer services remain a high priority for investment by NHS England and that the trust would continue to work with specialist commissioners to continue to secure commissioning commitments for the future.

Details of the financial plans were presented to the committee during the meetings and considered these to be robust and would be continued to be monitored through the robust governance processes in place.

5. Equalities Implications /Equality Impact Assessment

An Equalities Impact Assessment was undertaken and published by Clatterbridge Cancer Centre NHS Foundation Trust.

6. Conclusions/ Legal Implications

The Committee was established under Section 30 of the Local Authority (Public Health, Health and Wellbeing Boards and Health Scrutiny) Regulations 2013 to appoint a Joint Committee. The purpose of the committee has been carried out in accordance with these regulations to:

- a) make comments on the proposal consulted on;
- b) require the provision of information about the proposal; and has
- c) require a member or employee of a responsible person to attend before to answer questions in connection with the consultation.

The Committee was established in accordance with these regulations and within the agreed 'Protocol for Establishment of Joint Health Scrutiny in Cheshire and Merseyside'.

The committee heard evidence from a range of stakeholders including patients, relatives, staff and public during the process and duly considered the information to make and agree the recommendation to approve the proposals as set out in the Transforming Cancer Care Services' proposals.

7. Key to any abbreviations used

CCC	Clatterbridge Cancer Centre
MCCN	Merseyside and Cheshire Cancer Network
NHS	National Health Service

8. Documents attached

'Protocol for Establishment of Joint Health Scrutiny in Cheshire and Merseyside'
Minutes of the Joint Health Scrutiny Committee for Cheshire and Merseyside
Consultation Summary document